

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS  
EASTERN DIVISION**

<u>IN RE SULFURIC ACID</u>	)	<b>MDL Docket No. 1536</b>
<u>ANTITRUST LITIGATION</u>	)	<b>Case No. 03 C 4576</b>
	)	
<b>This Document Relates To:</b>	)	<b>Honorable Judge David H. Coar</b>
	)	<b>Magistrate Judge Jeffrey Cole</b>
<u><b>ALL RELATED ACTIONS</b></u>	)	

**JOINT STATUS REPORT**

Pursuant to the Court's order of September 3, 2008, Plaintiffs and Defendants Noranda, Inc., Falconbridge Limited, and NorFalco LLC (collectively the "Noranda Defendants"), General Alum New England Corp. d/b/a GAC Chemical Corporation, ("GAC"), Intertrade Holdings, Inc., Koch Sulfur Products Company, Koch Sulfur Products Company LLC and Pressure Vessel Services, Inc. hereby submit their Joint Status Report.

1. The first of these consolidated antitrust cases arising under Section 1 of the Sherman Act was filed on February 21, 2003. On July 1, 2003, the Multidistrict Litigation Panel entered a Conditional Transfer Order establishing this multidistrict litigation action before this Court. *See* Dkt. No. 1.

2. Thereafter, the parties engaged in extensive fact and expert discovery. With limited court-ordered exceptions, fact discovery in this case closed on July 1, 2005. The parties completed expert discovery in April 2006.

3. On April 27, 2006, GAC filed its Rule 12(b)(6) motion to dismiss the Plaintiffs' Third Consolidated Amended Class Action Complaint. *See* Dkt. No. 339. That motion was fully briefed on June 15, 2006. GAC's Position: GAC further notes that its pending motion to

dismiss renews and incorporates the motion to dismiss GAC originally filed on July 30, 2004 with respect to Plaintiffs' Second Consolidated Amended Class Action Complaint.

4. On May 22, 2006, all Defendants filed a joint *Daubert* motion to exclude the testimony of Plaintiffs' expert, Dr. Robert Tollison. *See* Dkt. No. 353. In addition, the Noranda Defendants, PVS, GAC, and Intertrade, among others, filed a *Daubert* motion to exclude the testimony of Plaintiffs' expert, Dr. James McClave. *See* Dkt. No. 350. The Koch Defendants filed a separate *Daubert* motion to exclude Dr. McClave's testimony. *See* Dkt. No. 356. The Marsulex Defendants have since withdrawn their support for, and joinder in these *Daubert* motions due to the settlement agreement they entered into with Plaintiffs.

5. On June 15, 2006, the Court referred the three *Daubert* motions to Magistrate Judge Jeffrey Cole for the preparation of reports and recommendations. *See* Dkt. Nos. 371 and 374. All three *Daubert* motions were fully briefed on September 14, 2006, and on November 1, 2006, the parties presented oral arguments on the motions. The motions remain pending before the Magistrate Judge.

6. On or before July 31, 2006, the Defendants, other than E.I. du Pont de Nemours and Company ("DuPont") who had reached a settlement agreement with Plaintiffs, filed a total of nine separate motions for summary judgment. Each Defendant, other than DuPont, joined in the motions filed by the other defendants. However, Defendants Chemtrade Logistics (U.S.), Inc. and Marsulex, Inc. (collectively "the Marsulex Defendants") subsequently withdrew their respective motions for summary judgment and their joinder in the other defendants' motions due to their settlement with the Plaintiffs. *See* Dkt. No. 569.

7. Thus, there are seven motions for summary judgment that have been fully briefed since December 12, 2006 that are currently pending before the Court:

- (a) Motion for summary judgment filed by GAC (Dkt. No. 413);
- (b) Motion for summary judgment filed by Noranda (Dkt. No. 418);
- (c) Motion for summary judgment filed by Intertrade (Dkt. No. 422);
- (d) Motion for summary judgment filed by Falconbridge Limited (Dkt. No. 426);
- (e) Motion for summary judgment filed by PVS, Inc. (Dkt. No. 430);
- (f) Motion for summary judgment filed by NorFalco LLC (Dkt. No. 433); and
- (g) Motion for summary judgment filed by Koch Sulfur Products Company and Koch Sulfur Products Company LLC (Dkt. No. 439).

8. On March 21, 2007, the Court granted Plaintiffs' motion to certify a litigation class of "All persons (excluding federal, state, and local governmental entities and political subdivisions, the Defendants, and their respective parents, subsidiaries and their affiliates) who purchased sulfuric acid in the United States directly from one or more of the Defendants or their parents, subsidiaries, affiliates, or joint ventures during the period from January 1, 1988 through January 16, 2003."<sup>1</sup> *See* Dkt. Nos. 535 and 536.

9. To date, three of the Defendants in this action have reached settlements with Plaintiffs. On December 20, 2006, the Court approved Plaintiffs' settlement with DuPont for the sum of \$5 million. *See* Dkt. No. 531. On May 15, 2008, the Court approved Plaintiffs' settlement with Marsulex and Chemtrade for a combined sum of \$1.15 million. *See* Dkt. No. 589. These settlements provide for the Settling Defendants to cooperate in the continuing prosecution of this case.

---

<sup>1</sup> For purposes of this litigation, "sulfuric acid" refers to non-fuming sulfuric acid (chemical formula: H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>), which is for illustration purposes (although not exclusively) sold at strengths 93% and 98%. It does not include spent regenerated or Florida fertilizer sulfuric acid. *See* Dkt. No. 552 and Exhibits "A" and "B" thereto.

10. Settlement discussions between Plaintiffs and certain remaining Defendants occurred more than a year ago, but no agreements were reached, and there are no discussions presently.

11. No pretrial schedule or trial date has been set.

Dated: September 16, 2008

Respectfully submitted:

/s/ Mary Jane Fait  
Mary Jane Fait  
Theodore B. Bell  
**WOLF HALDENSTEIN ADLER**  
**FREEMAN & HERZ LLC**  
55 West Monroe Street, Suite 1111  
Chicago, Illinois 60603  
Telephone: (312) 984-0000  
Facsimile: (312) 984-0001

Joseph C. Kohn  
Robert J. LaRocca  
William E. Hoeser  
**KOHN, SWIFT & GRAF, P.C.**  
One South Broad Street, Suite 2100  
Philadelphia, PA 19107  
Telephone: (215) 238-1700  
Facsimile: (215) 238-1968

Steven A. Asher  
David H. Weinstein  
Mindee J. Reuben  
**WEINSTEIN KITCHENOFF & ASHER LLC**  
1845 Walnut Street, Suite 1100  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 545-7200  
Facsimile: (215) 545-6535

Steven O. Sidener  
Joseph M. Barton  
**GOLD BENNETT CERA & SIDENER LLP**  
595 Market Street, Suite 2300  
San Francisco, CA 94105-2835  
Telephone: (415) 777-2230  
Facsimile: (415) 777-5189

***Plaintiffs' Co-Lead Counsel***

/s/ David C. Gustman  
David C. Gustman  
Jeffery M. Cross  
Jill C. Anderson  
**FREEBORN & PETERS LLP**  
311 S. Wacker Drive, Ste. 3000  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
Telephone: (312) 360-6000  
Facsimile: (312) 360-6597

**Counsel for Noranda Inc., Falconbridge Limited, NorFalco LLC, and also on behalf of General Alum New England Corp., d/b/a GAC Chemical Corporation, ("GAC"), Intertrade Holdings, Inc., Koch Sulfur Products Company, Koch Sulfur Products Company LLC and Pressure Vessel Services**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this the 16<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2008, a copy of the *Joint Status Report* was served by causing a true and correct copy to be delivered via facsimile and overnight delivery via Federal Express to the attached Service List.

**Dated:** September 16, 2008

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Mary Jane Fait  
Mary Jane Fait, Esq.  
Theodore B. Bell, Esq.  
**WOLF HALDENSTEIN ADLER  
FREEMAN & HERZ LLC**  
55 West Monroe Street, Suite 1111  
Chicago, Illinois 60603  
Tel: (312) 984-0000  
Fax: (312) 984-0001  
*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**SERVICE LIST**

**In Re Sulfuric Acid Antitrust Litigation; MDL No. 1536, Master File No. 03 C 4576**

**VIA FAX AND FEDERAL EXPRESS**

**FREEBORN & PETERS**

David C. Gustman  
Jeffrey M. Cross  
311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
Telephone: (312) 360-6000  
Fax Number: (312) 360-6520  
**Counsel for Defendants Falconbridge, Ltd.,  
Noranda, Inc., and Norfalco LLC**

**HOWREY SIMON ARNOLD &  
WHITE, LLP**

Joel C. Chefitz  
Todd L. McLawhorn  
321 North Clark Street, Suite 3400  
Chicago, Illinois 60610  
Telephone: (312) 595-1239  
Fax Number: (312) 595-2250  
**Counsel for Defendant Koch Industries, Inc.**

**CONNELLY, ROBERTS &  
McGIVNEY, LLC**

Michael P. Connelly  
William E. Snyder  
Cory D. Anderson  
One North Franklin, Suite 1200  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
Telephone: (312) 251-9600  
Fax Number: (312) 251-9601  
**Counsel for Defendant Intertrade  
Holdings, Inc.**

**BALLARD SPAHR ANDREWS &  
INGERSOLL, LLP**

Stephen J. Kastenbergh  
Eric W. Sitarchuk  
Carrie E. Watt  
1735 Market Street, 51<sup>st</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-7599  
Telephone: (215) 665-8500  
Fax Number: (215) 864-8999  
**Counsel for Defendant E.I. DuPont de Nemours  
and Company, Inc.**

**SANCHEZ & DANIELS**

Edward M. Ordonez  
Hugo Chaviano  
333 West Wacker Drive, Suite 500  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
Telephone: (312) 641-1555  
Fax Number: (312) 641-3004  
**Counsel for Defendants E.I. DuPont de Nemours  
and Company, Inc. and Norfalco, LLC**

**WINSTON & STRAWN LLP**

R. Mark McCareins  
35 West Wacker Drive, 41<sup>st</sup> Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60601  
Telephone: (312) 558-5600  
Fax Number: (312) 558-5700  
**Counsel for Defendants Marsulex, Inc. and  
ChemTrade**

**OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH,  
SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.**

Michael H. Cramer  
Two National Plaza  
20 S. Clark St., 25th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60603  
Telephone: (312) 558-1220  
Facsimile: (312)-807-3619  
**Counsel for Defendant Pressure Vessel  
Services, Inc.**

**BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP**

James P. Denvir  
5301 Wisconsin, Ave., NW  
Suite 800  
Washington, D.C. 20015  
Telephone: (202) 237-2727  
Fax Number: (202) 237-6131  
**Counsel for Defendant E.I. DuPont de Nemours  
and Company, Inc.**

**VERILL & DANA, LLP**

James T. Kilbreth  
One Portland Square  
P.O. Box 586  
Portland, Maine 04112-0586  
Telephone: (207) 774-4000  
Fax Number: (207) 774-7499  
**Counsel for Defendant**  
**GAC Chemical Corporation**

**DICKINSON WRIGHT PLLC**

K. Scott Hamilton  
500 Woodward Avenue  
Suite 4000  
Detroit, MI 48226-3425  
Telephone: (313) 223-3636  
Fax Number: (313) 223-3598  
**Counsel for Defendant**  
**PVS Chemicals, Inc.**

**(VIA FACSIMILE ONLY)**

**WEINSTEIN KITCHENOFF &  
ASHER, LLC**

Steven A. Asher  
Mindee Reuben  
1845 Walnut Street  
Suite 1100  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103  
Telephone: (215) 545-7200  
Fax Number: (215) 545-6535

**DICKINSON WRIGHT PLLC**

Edward H. Pappas  
38525 Woodward Avenue  
Suite 2000  
Bloomfield Hills, Michigan 48304-2970  
Telephone: (248) 433-7200  
Fax Number: (248) 433-7274  
**Counsel for Defendant**  
**PVS Chemicals, Inc.**

**(VIA FACSIMILE ONLY)**

**KOHN, SWIFT & GRAF, P.C.**

Joseph C. Kohn  
William E. Hoese  
Diana Liberto  
Robert LaRocca  
One South Broad Street, Suite 2100  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19107  
Telephone: (215) 238-1700  
Fax Number: (215) 238-1968

**(VIA FACSIMILE ONLY)**

**GOLD BENNETT CERA &  
SIDENER LLP**

Steven O. Sidener  
Joseph M. Barton  
595 Market Street, Suite 2300  
San Francisco, California 94105  
Telephone: (415) 777-2230  
Fax Number: (415) 777-5189